arXiv:1611.06528v1 [math.AC] 20 Nov 2016

ON THE RIGIDITY OF SYMBOLIC POWERS

MOHSEN ASGHARZADEH

Abstract. We deal with the rigidity conjecture of symbolic powers over regular rings. This was asked by Huneke. Along with our investigation, we confirm a conjecture [7, Conjecture 3.8].

1. Introduction

Throughout this note $(R,\mathfrak{m})$ is a regular local ring of dimension d, otherwise specialized. Recall that the n-the *symbolic power* of an ideal I defined by $I^{(n)}:=\bigcap_{\mathfrak{p}\in \mathrm{Ass}(I)}(I^nR_{\mathfrak{p}}\cap R)$. Our aim is to study the following rigidity-type question.

Question 1.1. (See [16, Question 31]) Assume that R is a d-dimensional regular local ring (or polynomial ring) and $\mathfrak{p}\in \mathrm{Spec}(R)$. If $\mathfrak{p}^{(d)}=\mathfrak{p}^d$, does it follow that $\mathfrak{p}^n=\mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$ for all $n\geq 1$?

Question 1.1 is true in dimension 3, see [14]. Also, rigidity of symbolic powers for the class of 1-dimensional Gorenstein prime ideals in 4-dimensional regular rings was proved by Huneke around 31 years ago, see [14]. Huneke and Ulrich extended it to the class of 1-dimensional prime ideals of regular rings that are *licci*, see [13]. In the light of [20] by Morey, we remark that:

Fact 1.2. (See Lemma 3.5) Suppose I is a Cohen-Macaulay, height two, and locally complete intersection ideal. Also, suppose $d>2$. Then $I^i=I^{(i)}$ for all $i>1$ if and only if $\mu(I)\leq d-1$.

What can say when $\mu(I)=d$? In Theorem 3.7 we show that:

Theorem 1.3. *Adopt the assumptions of Fact 1.2 and suppose in addition that $\mu(I)=d$. Then $I^i=I^{(i)}$ for all $i<d-1$ and $I^n\neq I^{(n)}$ $\forall n\geq d-1$. In particular, such an ideal confirms Question 1.1.*

In the graded situation and over polynomial rings, the claims $I^i=I^{(i)}$ for all $i<d-1$ and $I^{d-1}\neq I^{(d-1)}$ are in the recent paper [7]. One may try to drop the conditions forced over I. Such a dream overlaps with the following recent conjecture based on a "*computer experiments*":

Conjecture 1.4. (See [7]) Let $X\subset \mathbb{P}^3_k$ be a subvariety (reduced and unmixed) of codimension 2. Assume that there is a point $\mathfrak{p}\in X$ such that the localization of I_X at $\mathfrak{p}$ is not a complete intersection. Then $\forall m\geq 2$, the saturation of I_X^m has an embedded component at $\mathfrak{p}$. In particular, $I_X^m\neq I_X^{(m)}$ $\forall m\geq 2$.

Recall that throughout this note k is a field.

Theorem 1.5. *(See Section 4) Conjecture 1.4 is true in the irreducible case.*

Let us recall the following weak *rigidity-type* question:

Question 1.6. (See [16]) Assume that R is a d-dimensional regular local ring (or polynomial ring) and $\mathfrak{p}\in \mathrm{Spec}(R)$. If $\mathfrak{p}^{(i)}=\mathfrak{p}^i$, for all $i\leq d$ does it follow that $\mathfrak{p}^n=\mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$ for all $n\geq 1$?

2010 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 13D40; 13F20.

Key words and phrases. Cremona maps; polynomial rings; symbolic powers; regular rings.

We present the following result in dimension four.

Corollary 1.7. *(See Corollary 4.5) Question 1.6 is true for all Cohen-Macaulay prime ideals of height* 2 *in* 4*-dimensional regular local rings.*

In Section 5 we use the machinery of *birational geometry* to present the following example in dimension five.

Example 1.8. There is an ideal $I \lhd R := k[x_1, \ldots, x_5]$ such that $I^{(i)} = I^i$ for all $i \leq 7$ but $I^8 \neq I^{(8)}$. Such an ideal is 1-dimensional, Cohen-Macaulay and $\mu(I) = 5$.

2. Towards the rigidity in 1-dimensional case

The results in this section divides into three subsections. Subsection 2.A provides the preliminaries. The main result of the subsection 2.B is Proposition 2.9. The third subsection presents an application.

Subsection 2.A. Recall that an ideal I is called *complete intersection* if I is generated by a regular sequence of length equal to height of I.

Lemma 2.1. *(See* [14, Corollary 2.5]*) Let* $(R, \mathfrak{m})$ *be a regular local ring of dimension* 3 *and* $\mathfrak{p}$ *be a prime ideal of dimension one which is not a complete intersection. Then* $\mathfrak{p}^i \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ *for all* $i > 1$.

The grade of an ideal $\mathfrak{a}$ on a module M is defined by $\operatorname{grade}_A(\mathfrak{a}, M) := \inf\{i \in \mathbb{N}_0 | \operatorname{Ext}^i_R(R/\mathfrak{a}, M) \neq 0\}$. We use $\operatorname{depth}(M)$, when we deal with the maximal ideal of $*$-local rings. Denote the minimal number of generators of M by $\mu(M)$.

Discussion 2.2. An ideal $I \lhd R$ is called *perfect* if $\operatorname{p.dim}(R/I) = \operatorname{grade}(I, R)$. Also, I is called *strongly Cohen-Macaulay*, if its Koszul homologies $H_i(I, R)$ are all Cohen-Macaulay modules. The ideal I satisfies the G_∞ *condition* if for all $\mathfrak{p} \in \operatorname{V}(I)$, one has $\mu(I_\mathfrak{p}) \leq \operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{p})$.

Example 2.3. (See [2]) Perfect ideals of codimension two in a regular ring are strongly Cohen-Macaulay. Also, if $\mu(I) \leq \operatorname{ht}(I)+2$, R is Gorenstein and R/I is Cohen-Macaulay, then I is strongly Cohen-Macaulay.

Lemma 2.4. *(See* [13, Lemma 2.7]*) Let* R *be a local Gorenstein ring, let* I *be a perfect ideal which is strongly Cohen-Macaulay and* G_∞*. We write* $D := \dim(R/I)$*. Then for all* $n \geq d := \mu(I) - \operatorname{grade}(I, R)$*, we have* $\operatorname{depth}(R/I^{n+1}) = D - d$.

An ideal I is called almost complete intersection, if $\mu(I) = \operatorname{ht}(I) + 1$.[*]

Lemma 2.5. *(See* [17, Theorem 3.1]*) Let* R *be a Cohen-Macaulay ring and* $\mathfrak{p}$ *be a prime ideal which is an almost complete intersection. Then* $\mathfrak{p}^{(2)} = \mathfrak{p}^2$ *if and only if* $\mathfrak{p}R_\mathfrak{q}$ *is generated by an* $R_\mathfrak{q}$*-sequence* $\forall \mathfrak{q} \in \operatorname{V}(\mathfrak{p})$ *such that* $\dim((R/\mathfrak{p})_\mathfrak{q}) \leq 1$.

For an R-module M, the i^{th} local cohomology of M with respect to an ideal $\mathfrak{a}$ is defined by $H^i_\mathfrak{a}(M) := \varinjlim_n \operatorname{Ext}^i_R(R/\mathfrak{a}^n, M)$.

Notation 2.6. *By* $\mathfrak{m}$*, we mean the unique (graded) maximal ideal of a* $*$*-local ring.*

Subsection 2.B: Towards the rigidity in 1-dimensional case. Our interest in 1-dimensional ideals coming from the following easy fact:

[*]The definition presented in [17] is more general than this.

Fact 2.7. Let $I \lhd R$ be a radical ideal of dimension one. Then $I^{(n)}/I^n = H^0_{\mathfrak{m}}(R/I^n)$.

In this case, the equality of symbolic powers and ordinary powers translates to the positivity of the depth function $\operatorname{depth}(R/I^n)$. We should remark that the depth function is asymptotically constant, see [5]. In general, the depth function is quite mysterious. In the 1-dimensional case, the depth function takes at most two values $\{0, 1\}$. It may be worth to note that:

Example 2.8. Let n be any integer. There is an ideal I in a polynomial ring R such that

$$\operatorname{depth}(R/I^i) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } i < n \\ 1 & \text{if } i \geq n \end{cases}$$

This follows by [12, Corollary 10.3.12].

Our main tool to deal with the depth function is Lemma 2.4. For example, we show that:

Proposition 2.9. *Let $(R, \mathfrak{m})$ be a regular local ring of dimension d and $\mathfrak{p}$ be a prime ideal of dimension one generated by at most d elements. The following holds:*

a) Suppose $\mathfrak{p}^i = \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for some $i > 1$. Then
   i) $\mathfrak{p}^i = \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for all i.
   ii) $\mathfrak{p}$ generated by exactly $d - 1$ elements.

b) Suppose $\mathfrak{p}^{i_0} \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i_0)}$ for some $i_0 > 1$. Then $\mathfrak{p}^i \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for all $i > i_0$.

Proof. We first deal with the part a). As $\mathfrak{p}$ is almost complete intersection and of dimension one, one can easily check that $\mathfrak{p}$ is perfect, strongly Cohen-Macaulay and G_∞.

i) In view of Lemma 2.4, $f(n) := \operatorname{depth}(R/\mathfrak{p}^n)$ is constant for all $n > 1$. Having Fact 2.7 in mind, $f(i_0) \neq 0$. So, $f(n) \neq 0$ for all $n > 1$. As $f(n) \leq \dim R/\mathfrak{p}^n = 1$, we get $f(n) = 1$ for all $n > 1$. Again by Fact 2.7, $\mathfrak{p}^i = \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for all i.

ii) By part i), $\mathfrak{p}^2 = \mathfrak{p}^{(2)}$. By Lemma 2.5, $\mathfrak{p}_{\mathfrak{q}}$ is generated by an $R_{\mathfrak{q}}$-sequence for all $\mathfrak{q} \in \operatorname{V}(\mathfrak{p})$ such that $\dim R_{\mathfrak{q}}/\mathfrak{p}_{\mathfrak{q}} \leq 1$. For example we can take $\mathfrak{q} := \mathfrak{m}$. The proof is now complete.

b) Every d-generated prime ideal of height $d-1$ in a regular local ring of dimension d is generated by a weak d-sequence, see [15, 1.3]. In view of [15, Corollary 2.5], for an ideal generated by a weak d-sequence over an integral domain, one has

$$\operatorname{Ass}(R/\mathfrak{p}) \subseteq \operatorname{Ass}(R/\mathfrak{p}^2) \subseteq \ldots \subseteq \operatorname{Ass}(R/\mathfrak{p}^{i_0}) \subseteq \ldots \text{ }^{*} \quad (*)$$

As $\mathfrak{p}^{i_0} \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i_0)}$ and by Fact 2.7, $\operatorname{depth}(R/\mathfrak{p}^{i_0}) = 0$. Thus $\mathfrak{m} \in \operatorname{Ass}(R/\mathfrak{p}^{i_0})$. Applying $(*)$, we deduce that $\mathfrak{m} \in \operatorname{Ass}(R/\mathfrak{p}^i)$ for all $i > i_0$. In view of Fact 2.7, $\mathfrak{p}^i \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for all $i > i_0$. □

The following result shows that the assumption $\mu(\mathfrak{p}) = d$ is really important.

Lemma 2.10. *(See* [13]*) Let $(R, \mathfrak{m})$ be a regular local ring of dimension $d \geq 4$ and $\mathfrak{p}$ be a prime ideal of dimension one which is not a complete intersection and is in the linkage class of a complete intersection.*

i) If $R/\mathfrak{p}$ is Gorenstein, then $\mathfrak{p}^2 = \mathfrak{p}^{(2)}$ and $\mathfrak{p}^i \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for all $i > 2$.

ii) If $R/\mathfrak{p}$ is not Gorenstein, then $\mathfrak{p}^i \neq \mathfrak{p}^{(i)}$ for all $i \geq 2$.

Subsection 2.C. It was first asked in [9] that when is the natural map $\operatorname{Ext}^*_R(R/\mathfrak{a}, R) \longrightarrow \varinjlim \operatorname{Ext}^*_R(R/\mathfrak{a}^n, R)$ is injective.

* such a thing is not true in general, even one works over a polynomial ring and monomial ideals, see [18]. The folklore fact is: assymptotically such a sequence exists [5].

Corollary 2.11. *Let $\mathfrak{p}$ be as Lemma 2.10. Then, the natural map $\mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R) \to H^d_{\mathfrak{p}}(R)$ is not injective for all $n > 2$.*

Proof. We are going to apply Hartshorne-Lichtenbaum vanishing theorem. As regular local rings are analytically irreducible and $\dim R/\mathfrak{p} = 1$ we get that $H^d_{\mathfrak{p}}(R) = 0$. Thus, we need to show $\mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R) \neq 0$. Note that $\mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R) \neq 0$ if its Matlis dual $\mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R)^v$ is nonzero. By *local duality* and Fact 2.7, we get that

$$\mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R)^v \simeq H^0_{\mathfrak{m}}(R/\mathfrak{p}^n) = \mathfrak{p}^{(n)}/\mathfrak{p}^n,$$

which is nonzero. □

Remark 2.12. i) Let R be a standard graded polynomial ring over a field of characteristic zero. Let I be a homogeneous prime ideal such that $\mathrm{Proj}(R/I)$ is smooth. Fix an integer j. In view of [4, Corollary 1.2] the natural map

$$\varphi^*_{n,j} : \mathrm{Ext}^*_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R)_j \longrightarrow H^*_{\mathfrak{p}}(R)_j$$

is injective for all $n \gg 0$. Set $g := \mathrm{grade}(I, R)$. Also, the map $\varphi^g_{n,j}$ is injective for all $n \geq 1$. In particular, one may recover the well-known fact $\mathrm{Ext}^g_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R) \hookrightarrow H^g_{\mathfrak{p}}(R)$ is injective for all $n > 0$.

ii) Suppose $\mathfrak{p}$ is a homogeneous prime ideal of dimension one. Then $X := \mathrm{Proj}(R/\mathfrak{p}) = \{\mathfrak{p}\}$. Let $x = \mathfrak{p}$. Then $\mathcal{O}_{X,x}$ is regular. So X is smooth. Set $d = \dim R$. By part i),

$$\varphi^d_{n,j} : \mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R)_j \longrightarrow \varinjlim \mathrm{Ext}^d_R(R/\mathfrak{p}^n, R)_j$$

is injective for all $n \gg 0$. The point is that for each j there is n_j such that $\varphi_{n,j}$ is injective for all $n > n_j$. In particular, by applying the graded version of Corollary 2.11, there is no uniform bound for $\{n_j\}$.

3. Towards the rigidity in codimension two

We start with the following well-known (and motivational) example.

Example 3.1. Let $R = k[x_0, \ldots, x_3]$ and let $\mathfrak{p} := I_2(A)$ where

$$A := \begin{pmatrix} x_0 & x_1 & x_2 \\ x_1 & x_2 & x_3 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Then $\mathfrak{p}$ is perfect of height two with three generators and $\mathfrak{p}^n = \mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$ for all n.

An ideal I is called *generically complete intersection* if $I_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is complete intersection for all $\mathfrak{p} \in \min(I)$. Also, recall that I is called *locally complete intersection* if $I_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is complete intersection for all $\mathfrak{p} \in \mathrm{V}(I)\backslash\{\mathfrak{m}\}$. In the graded situation we assume in addition that $\mathfrak{p}$ is homogeneous. Our interest coming from the following fact:

Fact 3.2. Let I be a locally complete intersection ideal. Then $I^{(n)}/I^n = H^0_{\mathfrak{m}}(R/I^n)$.

Lemma 3.3. *Let I be a Cohen-Macaulay height two ideal generated by d elements in a regular local ring R of dimension d. If I is locally complete intersection, then* $\mathrm{depth}(R/I^n) = \mathrm{depth}(R/I^d)$ *for all* $\forall n \geq d-1$.

Proof. It is easy to see that such an ideal is perfect and G_∞. Due to Example 2.3, I is strongly Cohen-Macaulay. It remains to apply Lemma 2.4. □

The same argument suggests:

Corollary 3.4. *Let $\mathfrak{p}$ be a Cohen-Macaulay height two prime ideal generated by 3 elements in a regular local ring R of dimension 4. Then $\operatorname{depth}(R/\mathfrak{p}^n) = \operatorname{depth}(R/\mathfrak{p}^4)$ for all $n \geq 2$.*

For each $X \subseteq \operatorname{Spec}(R)$ and any ℓ, set $X^{\geq \ell} := \{\mathfrak{p} \in X : \operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{p}) \geq \ell\}$.

Lemma 3.5. *Let I be a Cohen-Macaulay height two ideal locally complete intersection in a regular local ring R of dimension $d = \dim R > 2$. Then $I^i = I^{(i)}$ for all $i > 1$ if and only if $\mu(I) \leq d - 1$.*

Proof. Suppose first that $I^i = I^{(i)}$ for all $i > 1$. The ideal I is prefect, because $\operatorname{p.dim}(I) < \infty$. Clearly, a locally complete intersection ideal is generically complete intersection. In particular, we are in the situation of [20, Corollary 3.4]. We note that the proof of [20, Corollary 3.4] uses the existence of a prime ideal of height ≥ 3. Here, is the place that we use the assumption $d > 2$. Now, [20, Corollary 3.4] shows that $\mu(I) \leq d - 1$.

Now, suppose $\mu(I) \leq d - 1$. Recall that a locally complete intersection ideal is generically complete intersection. In view of Example 2.3, I is strongly Cohen-Macaulay. Since I is locally complete intersection,

$$\mu(IR_{\mathfrak{q}}) = \operatorname{grade}(IR_{\mathfrak{q}}, R_{\mathfrak{q}}) = \operatorname{ht}(IR_{\mathfrak{q}}) = 2 \leq \operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{q}) - 1$$

for all $\mathfrak{q} \in \operatorname{V}(I) \setminus \{\mathfrak{m}\}$ with $3 \leq \operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{q})$. Also, $\mu(I) \leq d - 1 = \operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{m}) - 1$. In particular,

$$\mu(I_{\mathfrak{q}}) \leq \operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{q}) - 1 \quad \forall \mathfrak{q} \in \operatorname{V}(I)^{\geq 3}.$$

By [20, Lemma 3.1], $I^i = I^{(i)}$ for all i. □

The assumption $d > 2$ [*] is important:

Example 3.6. Let $R := k[[x, y]]$ and $I := (x, y)$. Then $I^n = I^{(n)}$ for all n. But, $\mu(I) > d - 1$.

Theorem 3.7. *Let I be a Cohen-Macaulay height two ideal generated by exactly d elements in a regular local ring R of dimension $d > 2$. Suppose I is locally complete intersection. Then $I^i = I^{(i)}$ for all $i < d-1$ and $I^n \neq I^{(n)}$ $\forall n \geq d - 1$.*

We barrow some lines throughout [7].

Proof. By Fact 3.2, $I^{(n)}/I^n = H^0_{\mathfrak{m}}(R/I^n)$. This means that $I^i = I^{(i)}$ if and only if $\operatorname{depth}(R/I^i) > 0$. Combining these along with Lemma 3.3, we observe

$$I^i = I^{(i)} \ \exists i \geq d - 1 \iff I^i = I^{(i)} \ \forall i \geq d - 1. \quad (*)$$

In view of [23, Theorem 5.1], $\operatorname{Sym}^i(I) \simeq I^i$ for all $i \leq d$, because of the locally complete intersection assumption. Due to Hilbert-Burch, $0 \to \mathrm{R}^{d-1} \to R^d \to I \to 0$ is exact. In the light of [25], the following (not necessarily exact) complex

$$F_i : 0 \longrightarrow \bigwedge^{i}(R^{d-1}) \longrightarrow \bigwedge^{i-1}(R^{d-1}) \otimes R^d \longrightarrow \ldots \longrightarrow R^{d-1} \otimes \operatorname{Sym}^{i-1}(R^d) \longrightarrow \operatorname{Sym}^i(R^d)$$

approximates $\operatorname{Sym}^i(I) \simeq I^i$.

Let $C := \ker\big(\operatorname{Sym}(R^d) \to \operatorname{Sym}(I)\big)$. Note that $\mathcal{R} := \operatorname{Sym}(R^d) = R[X_1, \ldots, X_d]$. Thus, $C \lhd \mathcal{R}$. Denote the Koszul complex of C in $\mathcal{R}$ by K. We should remark that $\mathcal{R}$ is a graded polynomial ring. The i-th spot of K is the above complex F_i. Let $\mathfrak{p} \in \operatorname{V}(I) \setminus \{\mathfrak{m}\}$. To prove $(F_i)_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is exact, we need to show

[*] In the case of projective geometry there is no restriction on the dimension, because in the construction of $\mathbb{P}^n$ we disregard the graded maximal ideal.

$\mathrm{K}_{\mathfrak{p}[X_1,\ldots,X_d]}$ is exact. Such a thing is the case if $C_{\mathfrak{p}[X_1,\ldots,X_d]}$ is complete intersection. Let us check this. There are regular elements f, g such that $I_{\mathfrak{p}} = (f, g)$. Then $0 \to R_{\mathfrak{p}} \to R_{\mathfrak{p}}^2$ approximates $I_{\mathfrak{p}}$. Thus

$$0 \to \mathrm{R}_{\mathfrak{p}}^{d-1} \to R_{\mathfrak{p}}^d \to I_{\mathfrak{p}} \to 0 \simeq (0 \to R_{\mathfrak{p}}^2 \to R_{\mathfrak{p}} \to I_{\mathfrak{p}} \to 0) \oplus (0 \to \mathrm{R}_{\mathfrak{p}}^{d-2} \xrightarrow{\simeq} \mathrm{R}_{\mathfrak{p}}^{d-2} \to 0 \to 0)$$

This yields that $C_{\mathfrak{p}[X_1,\ldots,X_d]} = (fX_1 - gX_2, X_3 \ldots, X_d)$ which is complete intersection. In sum, we observed that F_i have finite length homologies.

Suppose $i < d$. Then, in view of the *new intersection theorem* [21], F_i is acyclic. Conclude from Auslander-Buchsbaum formula that $\mathrm{depth}(R/I^i) > 0$ for all $i < d-1$. This implies that

$$I^i = I^{(i)} \ \forall i < d-1.$$

Suppose on the contradiction that $I^n = I^{(n)}$ for some $n \geq d-1$. Via the last displayed item and $(*)$, we deduce that $I^n = I^{(n)}$ for all n. Then by Lemma 3.5, $\mu(I) = d-1$ which is a contradiction. □

Corollary 3.8. *Let I be a Cohen-Macaulay height two ideal generated by at least d elements in a regular local ring R of dimension $d > 2$. Suppose I is locally complete intersection. Then $I^i = I^{(i)}$ for all $i < d-1$ and $I^{d-1} \neq I^{(d-1)}$.*

Proof. This is contained in the above proof. □

The assumption $d > 2$ is important:

Example 3.9. Let $R := k[[x, y]]$ and $I := (x, y)$. Then $\mu(I) = 2 > d-1$. Clearly, $I^2 = I^{(2)}$.

The locally complete intersection assumption is important:

Example 3.10. Look at $I := (yzw, xzw, xyw, xyz)$ as an ideal in $R := k[x, y, z, w]$. Then I is a Cohen-Macaulay height two ideal generated by exactly 4 elements in a $*$-local regular ring R of dimension 4. It is easy to observe that $x^m yzw \in I^{(2)} \setminus I^2$ for all large m. Thus $I^{(2)} \neq I^2$.

The codimension two assumption is important:

Example 3.11. Set $R := k[x_1, \ldots, x_5]$. We look at the pentagon as a simplicial complex. Its Stanley-Reisner ring is

$$R_\Delta := k[\underline{x}]/I_\Delta := R/(x_1x_3, x_1x_4, x_2x_4, x_2x_5, x_3x_5).$$

Note that I_Δ is a height three ideal. So, $\dim(\Delta) = \dim R_\Delta - 1 = 1$. By the help of Macaulay 2, the projective resolution of R_Δ over R is

$$0 \longrightarrow R \longrightarrow R^4 \longrightarrow R^5 \longrightarrow R \longrightarrow R_\Delta \longrightarrow 0$$

Due to Auslander-Buchsbaum formula, $\mathrm{depth}_R(R_\Delta) = 2 = \dim(R_\Delta)$. Thus I_Δ is perfect and of codimension 3 generated minimally by 5 elements. In view of [22, Proposition 1.11], I_Δ is locally complete intersection. Thanks to Macaulay2, $\mathrm{p.dim}(R/I_\Delta^3) = 5$. By Auslander-Buchsbaum formula, $\mathrm{depth}(R/I_\Delta^3) = 0$. In the light of Lemma 2.4, $\mathrm{depth}(R/I_\Delta^n) = 0$ for all $n \geq 3$. Consequently, $I_\Delta^n \neq I_\Delta^{(n)}$ for all $n \geq 3$, because I_Δ is locally complete intersection. Similarly, $\mathrm{p.dim}(R/I_\Delta^2) = 3$ and consequently $I_\Delta^2 = I_\Delta^{(2)}$.

In fact, the above example suggests:

Corollary 3.12. *Let I be a perfect ideal of height $d-2$ with minimally d generators in a d-dimensional regular local ring R. If I is locally complete intersection, then $I^n \neq I^{(n)}$ for all $n \geq 3$.*

Proof. As $\mu(I) - \operatorname{grade}(I, R) \leq 2$, I is strongly Cohen-Macaulay, because of Example 2.3. By Lemma 2.4, $\operatorname{depth}(R/I^n) = 0$ for all $n \geq 3$. So, $I^n \neq I^{(n)}$.

□

The Cohen-Macaulay assumption is important:

Example 3.13. Let $\mathcal{C}$ be the curve in $\mathbb{P}^3$ parameterized by $\{s^4, s^3t, st^3, t^4\}$. This is the *Macaulay*'s curve. Denote the ideal of definition of $\mathcal{C}$ by $\mathfrak{p}$ which is a prime ideal in $k[x, y, z, w]$. This is well-known that $\mu(\mathfrak{p}) = 4$, $\mathfrak{p}^n = \mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$ for all n and that $R/\mathfrak{p}$ is not Cohen-Macaulay. One can show that $\mathfrak{p}$ is locally complete intersection (for a quick proof please see Theorem 4.4, below). Also, $\operatorname{ht}(\mathfrak{p}) = 2$. In particular, the Cohen-Macaulay assumption in Theorem 3.7 is really important.

4. Weak rigidity in dimension four

First, we focus on:

Conjecture 4.1. (See [7, Conjecture 3.8]) Let $X \subset \mathbb{P}^3_k$ be a subvariety (reduced and unmixed) of codimension 2. Assume that there is a point $\mathfrak{p} \in X$ such that the localization of I_X at $\mathfrak{p}$ is not a complete intersection. Then $\forall m \geq 2$, the saturation of I_X^m has an embedded component at $\mathfrak{p}$. In particular, $I_X^m \neq I_X^{(m)}$ for all $m \geq 2$.

Proposition 4.2. *In the monomial case we have $I^m \neq I^{(m)}$ for all $m \geq 2$.*

Proof. Recall that I is an ideal in the ring $R := k[x_1, \ldots, x_4]$. As I is radical, unmixed and monomial, we have

$$I = \operatorname{rad}(I) = \bigcap_{\text{for some pairs } (i \neq j)} (x_i, x_j).$$

Let G be the *graph* with the vertex set $\{1, \ldots, 4\}$ where $\{i, j\}$ is an edge, if such a pair appears in the above intersection. Suppose on the contradiction that $I^m = I^{(m)}$ for some $m \geq 2$. Thanks to [19, Theorem 3.2 and Theorem 3.3], G is a path or a cycle or the union of two disjoint edges. In the case of union of two disjoint edges, I is locally complete intersection (see [22, Example 1.18]) which is excluded by the conjecture. So, we may assume that G is connected. Deduce from [22, Proposition 1.11] that I is locally complete intersection which is excluded by the conjecture. This contradiction shows that $I^m \neq I^{(m)}$ for all $m \geq 2$. □

The following result is well-known and easy.

Lemma 4.3. *Let $R \to S$ be a flat ring map (e.g. localization with respect to a multiplicative closed set). Let $\mathfrak{q} \lhd R$ be a prime ideal such that $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{q}S$ is a prime ideal of S. Then $\mathfrak{q}^{(n)}S = \mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$.*

Theorem 4.4. *Conjecture 4.1 is true for irreducible varieties.*

Proof. Let $\mathfrak{q}$ be the defining ideal of the variety $X \subset \mathbb{P}^3$. Then, $\mathfrak{q}$ is a height two prime ideal in $R := k[x_1, \ldots, x_4]$ which is not locally complete intersection. Note that $\mathfrak{q}R_{\mathfrak{q}}$ is generated by a regular sequence, because it is a maximal ideal of a regular local ring. There is a prime ideal $\mathfrak{p}$ of height three such that $\mathfrak{q}R_{\mathfrak{p}}$ can not be generated by a regular sequence. Keep in mind that $R_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is a regular local ring of dimension 3 and $\mathfrak{q}R_{\mathfrak{p}}$ is a prime ideal of height two which is not a complete intersection ideal. Set $\mathcal{S} := R \setminus \mathfrak{p}$. In the light of Lemma 2.1,

$$(\mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q})^m \neq (\mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q})^{(m)} \quad \forall m > 1 \quad (*)$$

One can find easily that $(\mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q})^m = \mathcal{S}^{-1}(\mathfrak{q}^m)$. If $\mathfrak{q}^m = \mathfrak{q}^{(m)}$ were be the case, in view of Lemma 4.3, we should have

$$(\mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q})^m = \mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q}^m = \mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q}^{(m)} = (\mathcal{S}^{-1}\mathfrak{q})^{(m)},$$

which is a contradiction via $(*)$. So, $\mathfrak{q}^m \neq \mathfrak{q}^{(m)}$ for all $m > 1$. □

Now, we are ready to present:

Corollary 4.5. *Let $\mathfrak{p}$ be a 2-dimensional Cohen-Macaulay prime ideal in a regular local ring (or a polynomial ring) of dimension four. If $\mathfrak{p}^{(i)} = \mathfrak{p}^i$ for all $i \leq 4$, then $\mathfrak{p}^n = \mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$ for all $n \geq 1$.*

Proof. In view of Theorem 4.4 we may assume that $\mathfrak{p}$ is locally complete intersection. If $\mu(\mathfrak{p}) \leq 3$, by the help of Lemma 3.5, we observe that $\mathfrak{p}^n = \mathfrak{p}^{(n)}$ for all $n \geq 1$. Suppose $\mu(\mathfrak{p}) \geq 4$. Then we are in the situation of Corollary 3.8. In view of Corollary 3.8, $\mathfrak{p}^{(3)} \neq \mathfrak{p}^3$. This is excluded by the assumptions. The proof is now complete. □

5. Non-rigidity in dimension five

The rings in this section are of zero characteristic. Our aim is to prove Example 1.8.

Discussion 5.1. Let $X \subset \mathbb{P}^n$ be an projective variety. Given a rational map $\mathrm{F} : X \dashrightarrow \mathbb{P}^n$ into another projective space, $Y \subset \mathbb{P}^n$ denote its image. Recall that F is called birational onto its image if there exists a rational map $\mathrm{G} : Y \dashrightarrow \mathbb{P}^n$ whose image is X. When such a thing happens we say F is a *Cremona transformation*. Note that F (resp. G) determines by forms $\underline{f} := f_0, \ldots, f_n$ (resp. $\underline{g}$) of same degree. By d (resp. d') we mean $\deg(f_i)$ (resp. $\deg(g_j)$). Also, $\underline{g}$ is called *representatives of the inverse*. The ideal generated by $\underline{f}$ is called the *base ideal*. By a result of Gabber, $d' \leq d^{n-1}$, see [3]. In particular, when $n = 2$ one can recover the classical result $d = d'$.

Lemma 5.2. *Adopt the above notation and let I be the base ideal generated by forms of degree $d \geq 2$. Assume the following conditions hold:*

i) $\operatorname{depth}(R/I) > 0$,
ii) $I^{(\ell)}/I^\ell$ *is either zero or* $\mathfrak{m}$*-primary for all* ℓ*, and*
iii) The Rees algebra $\mathrm{R}(I)$ *satisfies in the Serre's condition* (S_2).

Then $I^\ell = I^{(\ell)}$ for all $\ell < d'$ and $I^{d'} \neq I^{(d')}$, where d' is the degree of representatives of the inverse.

Proof. In the light of [6, Theorem 2.1] we observe that the symbolic Rees algebra $\mathrm{R}^{(I)} := \bigoplus_s I^{(s)}t^s$ is equal to $R[It, Dt^{d'}]$, where D is called the *source inversion*. We note that D is defined by the equation

$$g_i(f_0, \ldots, f_n) = Dx_i \quad \forall i \quad (*)$$

In particular, for all $i < d'$, one has

$$I^{(i)} = \mathrm{R}^{(I)}_i = \mathrm{R}(I)_i = I^i$$

By $(*)$, we have $\deg(D) = dd' - 1$. Thus, $D \in \mathrm{R}^{(I)}_{d'} \setminus I^{d'} = I^{(d')} \setminus I^{d'}$. □

Discussion 5.3. Let us revisit $I := (yzw, xzw, xyw, xyz)$ as an ideal in $A := k[x, y, z, w]$. Then I is square-free and is 3-Veronese. Such an ideal is perfect, of height 2, 4-generated and the depth of its powers are computed by the following table (see [12, Corollary 10.3.7])

$$\operatorname{depth}(R/I^n) = \begin{cases} 2 & \text{if } n = 1 \\ 1 & \text{if } n = 2 \\ 0 & \text{if } n > 2 \end{cases}$$

Let us show that the assumption ii) in Lemma 5.2 is really needed.

Example 5.4. Look at $I := (yzw, xzw, xyw, xyz)$ as an ideal in $R := k[x, y, z, w]$. We note that I is the base ideal of the Cremona map $\mathrm{F} : \mathbb{P}^3 \dashrightarrow \mathbb{P}^3$.

i) In view of Example 3.10, the module $I^{(2)}/I^2$ is not zero. By Discussion 5.3, $\operatorname{depth}(R/I^2) = 1$. Thus, $\mathfrak{m} \notin \operatorname{Ass}(R/I^2)$. Therefore, I^2 has no $\mathfrak{m}$-primary component. So, $I^{(2)}/I^2$ is not $\mathfrak{m}$-primary.

ii) Here, we show that I respects the conditions i) and iii) in Lemma 5.2. In the light of [24], $\overline{I^n} = I^n$ for all n. This means that $\mathrm{R}(I)$ is normal. Normal rings satisfy in (S_2). Also, $\operatorname{depth}(R/I) = 2 > 0$.

iii) Suppose on the contradiction that Lemma 5.2 is true without its second assumption. Recall that F defines via the partial derivations of $f := xyzw$. This is well-known and classical from birational geometry that F is *standard involution*, i.e., it is self-inverse as a rational map. In particular, $d = d' = 3$. In view of Lemma 5.2 we should have $I^2 = I^{(2)}$ which is a contradiction with Example 3.10.

Remark 5.5. i) The assumption $d > 1$ is important. Because in the case of plane Cremona transformation, one has $d = d'$. Then, $d = 1$ yields the trivial contradiction that $I \neq I^{(1)}$.

ii) Concerning the (S_2) condition, we cite the following question of Huneke ([16, Question 32]): Let R be a regular local ring containing $\mathbb{C}$, and let $\mathfrak{p} \in \operatorname{Spec}(R)$. Does it follow that there exists a non-zerodivisor of degree 1 in the associated graded ring $\operatorname{gr}_{\mathfrak{p}}(R)$?

Corollary 5.6. *Let I be a 1-dimensional graded ideal of a polynomial ring R. The following holds:*

i) $I^{(\ell)}/I^{\ell}$ is either zero or $\mathfrak{m}$-primary for all ℓ.

ii) If in addition I is an almost complete intersection, then $\mathrm{R}(I)$ satisfies in (S_2).

Proof. The first item follows by Fact 2.7. In view of [11, Corollary 10.4], $\operatorname{Sym}(I)$ is Cohen-Macaulay. Recall from [11, Corollary 3.10] that $\operatorname{Sym}(I) \simeq \mathrm{R}(I)$. This yields the claim. □

Let us apply things in an important example due to Dolgachev:

Example 5.7. Let $f := x(xz+y^2)$. In view of [8, Page 192], the partial derivations $\{\partial f/\partial x, \partial f/\partial y, \partial f/\partial z\}$ define a plane Cremona transformation. Such a transformation is called *polar* transformation. It is easy to find that the base ideal $I = (2xz + y^2, xy, x^2)$ is perfect and of codimension 2. Recall that $d' = d = 2$. We combine Corollary 5.6 along with Lemma 5.2 to observe that $I^2 \neq I^{(2)}$.

The idea is to take a glance at a Cremona map such that $d' = d^{n-1}$. Let us look at the system $\{x^2, xy, wx + y^2, zx + w^2, ux + z^2\}$. This defines a birational map $\mathbb{P}^4 \dashrightarrow \mathbb{P}^4$ such that $d' = d^{n-1}$.

Lemma 5.8. *Let $A := k[X, Y, W, Z, U]$ and let $I := (X^2, XY, WX + Y^2, ZX + W^2, UX + Z^2)$. Set $R := \frac{A}{I}$. Then $\operatorname{depth}(R) > 0$.*

Proof. We use lowercase letters to represent the elements in R. We show u is a regular element. Clearly $\min(I) = (X)$, and $\min(R) = \{xR\}$. Since $\{y^2, w^2, z^2\} \subset (x)$, we get that $\mathfrak{m} = \sqrt{(x, u)}$. It turns out that u is a homogeneous parameter element. Look at R as a $k[u]$-module. The set

$$\Gamma := \{1, x, y, w, z, y^2, yw, w^2, wz, w^3, ywz\}$$

is a generating set for R as a $k[u]$-module. Since Γ is linearly independent over $k[u]$, we observe that R is free as a $k[u]$-module. Clearly, u is regular over $k[u]$. So, u is a regular element viewed as an element in R. So, $\operatorname{depth}(R) > 0$. □

The following computation from Macaulay2 shows that $\mathrm{Ass}(A/I) = \{(x, y, z, w)\}$ and that $\mathrm{p.dim}(A/I) = 4$. By Auslander-Buchsbaum formula, we recheck two times that $\mathrm{depth}(R) = 1$.

Computation 5.9.
i1 : R=QQ[x,y,w,z,u]
o1 = R
o1 : PolynomialRing
i2 : I=ideal(x^2,x*y,w*x+y^2,z*x+w^2,u*x+z^2)
o2 = ideal (x^2, $x*y$, y^2+x*w, w^2+x*z, z^2+x*u)
o2 : Ideal of R
i3 : resolution I

$$\text{o3} = R^{1} \xleftarrow{} R^{5} \xleftarrow{} R^{9} \xleftarrow{} R^{7} \xleftarrow{} R^{2} \xleftarrow{} 0$$

(homological degrees: 0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5)

o3 : ChainComplex
i4 : associatedPrimes I
o4 = {*ideal* (z, w, y, x)}
o4 : List

Now, we are in a position to present:

Example 5.10. Let $R := k[x, y, w, z, u]$ and let $I := (x^2, xy, wx + y^2, zx + w^2, ux + z^2)$. Then $I^{(i)} = I^i$ for all $i < 8$ but $I^8 \neq I^{(8)}$.

Proof. We are going to apply Lemma 5.2. We should check its assumptions. We start our task by recalling that I is generated by $\mathrm{ht}(I) + 1$ elements, e.g., I is almost complete intersection. In view of Lemma 5.8, depth of R/I is strictly positive. In order to apply Corollary 5.6 we note that $\dim(R/I) = 1$. By Corollary 5.6, R(I) is (S_2) and $I^{(\ell)}/I^{\ell}$ is either zero or $\mathfrak{m}$-primary for all ℓ. The polynomials $\{x^2, xy, wx + y^2, zx + w^2, ux + z^2\}$ defines a birational map F : $\mathbb{P}^4 \dashrightarrow \mathbb{P}^4$. Its base ideal is I and its degree is 2. This is well-known that $d' = 2^3 = 8$. We finish our task by applying Lemma 5.2 to observe that $I^{(i)} = I^i$ for all $i < 8$ and $I^8 \neq I^{(8)}$, as claimed. □

Acknowledgement . I thank Prof. Simis. His comments motivate me to write sections 3 and 4. We check examples by the help of Macaulay2. Also, I thank Dr. Ahangary for his comment on Macaulay2.

References

[1] Y. Aoyama, *A remark on almost complete intersections*, Manuscripta math, **22** (1977), 225–228.
[2] L. Avramov, and J. Herzog, *The Koszul algebra of a codimension 2 embedding*, Math. Z. **175** (1980), 249-260.
[3] H. Bass, E. Connell, and D. Wright, *The Jacobian conjecture: reduction of degree and formal expansion of the inverse*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. 7 (1982), 287-330.
[4] B. Bhatt, M. Blickle, G. Lyubeznik, A.K. Singh, and W. Zhang, *Stabilization of the cohomology of thickenings*, arXiv:1605.09492 [math.AG].
[5] M. Brodmann, *Asymptotic stability of Ass*$(M/I^n M)$, Proceedings of AMS **74**, (1979), 16-18.
[6] B. Costa, A. Simis, and Z. Ramos, *A theorem about Cremona maps and symbolic Rees algebras*, Internat. J. Algebra Comput. **24** (2014), 1191-1212.
[7] S. Cooper, G. Fatabbi, E. Guardo, A. Lorenzini, J. Migliore, U. Nagel, A. Seceleanu, J. Szpond and A. Van Tuyl, *Symbolic powers of codimension two Cohen-Macaulay ideals*, arXiv:1606.00935[Math.AC]

[8] I.V. Dolgachev, *Polar Cremona transformations*, Michigan Math. J. **48** (2000), 191–202.

[9] D. Eisenbud, M. Mustata, and M. Stillman, *Cohomology on toric varieties and local cohomology with monomial supports*, J. Symbolic Comput. **29** (2000), 583-600.

[10] D. Grayson, and M. Stillman, *Macaulay2, a software system for research in algebraic geometry*, Available at http://www.math.uiuc.edu/Macaulay2/.

[11] J. Herzog, A. Simis, and W. V.Vasconcelos, *Koszul homology and blowing-up rings*, Commutative algebra (Trento, 1981), Lecture Notes in Pure and Appl. Math., **84**, Dekker, New York, (1983), 79-169.

[12] J. Herzog, and T. Hibi, *Monomial ideals, Graduate Texts in Mathematics*, **260** Springer-Verlag London, Ltd., London, (2011)

[13] C. Huneke, and B. Ulrich, *Powers of licci ideals*, Commutative algebra (Berkeley, CA, 1987), 339-346, Math. Sci. Res. Inst. Publ., **15**, Springer, New York, 1989.

[14] C. Huneke, *The primary components and integral closures of ideals in 3-dimensional regular local rings*, Math. Ann. **275** (1986), 617-635.

[15] C. Huneke, *Powers of ideals generated by weak d-sequences*, J. Algebra **68** (1981), 471-509.

[16] C. Huneke, and C. Raicu, *Introduction to uniformity in commutative algebra*, lectures given by the first author as part of an introductory workshop at MSRI for the program in Commutative Algebra, 2012–13, arXiv:1408.7098 [math.AC].

[17] C. Huneke, *Symbolic powers of prime ideals and special graded algebras*, Comm. Algebra **9** (1981), 339-366.

[18] T. Kaiser, M. Stehlk, and R. Skrekovski, *Replication in critical graphs and the persistence of monomial ideals*, J. Combin. Theory Ser. A **123** (2014), 239-251.

[19] N.C. Minh, and N.V. Trung, *Cohen-Macaulayness of powers of two-dimensional squarefree monomial ideals*, J. Algebra **322** (2009), 4219-4227.

[20] S. Morey, *Stability of associated primes and equality of ordinary and symbolic powers of ideals*, Comm. Algebra **27** (1999), 3221-3231.

[21] P. Roberts, *Le theoreme d intersection*, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris Ser. I Math., **304** (1987), 177-180.

[22] N. Terai, and K.I. Yoshida, *Locally complete intersection Stanley-Reisner ideals*, Illinois J. Math. **53** (2009), 413-429.

[23] A. Tchernev, *Torsion freeness of symmetric powers of ideals*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **359** (2007), 3357-3367.

[24] R.H. Villarreal, *Normality of subrings generated by square free monomials*, J. Pure Appl. Algebra **113** (1996), 91-106.

[25] J. Weyman, *Resolutions of the exterior and symmetric powers of a module*, J. Algebra **58**, (1979) 333–341.

E-mail address: mohsenasgharzadeh@gmail.com